

**ABSTRACT/PAPER REVIEW FORM
2018 DCA CONFERENCE**

Abstract Number: 002

Abstract/Paper Title: The Role of Retrofits

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
1. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes		x		6
2. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.		x		6
3. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.	x			7
4. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.		x		6
5. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.	x			7
6. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.			x	5
7. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.		x		6
8. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.			x	5
9. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.		x		6
10. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees	x			7
Please Add Total Points from All Rows: 6+				

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):

The brief abstract tries to emphasize the importance of importance of 'retrofitting' in an educational curriculum.

However, the themes and issues are not clearly defined and there is quite a of repetition in the text. Also: how the particular case (an atrium in a warm climate) addresses the central issues of education and simulation does not become very clear.

Some doubts, needs work...

Reviewer Recommendation:

Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.

1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)

2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)

3. **Not Recommended**

**ABSTRACT/PAPER REVIEW FORM
2018 DCA CONFERENCE**

Abstract Number: 002

Abstract/Paper Title: the role of retrofits in architectural education

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
1. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes			X	2
2. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.		X		5
3. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.	X			8
4. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.			X	2
5. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.			X	2
6. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.			X	2
7. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.			X	2
8. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.			X	2
9. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.		X		5
10. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees		X		5
Please Add Total Points from All Rows: 33				

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):

The abstract is incomplete. More background and descriptions of the project and results would enable reviewers to more effectively comment on the project.

Reviewer Recommendation:

Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.

1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)

2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)

3. **Not Recommended**

**ABSTRACT/PAPER REVIEW FORM
2018 DCA CONFERENCE**

Abstract Number: 002

Abstract/Paper Title: The Role of Retrofits in Architecture Education

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
1. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes	v			10
2. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.	v			10
3. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.	v			10
4. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.	v			9
5. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.		v		6
6. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.	v			10
7. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.	v			9
8. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.			v	0
9. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.		v		7
10. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees	v			10
Please Add Total Points from All Rows: 81				

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):

- Need more background information with more references
- No reference(s) used for this abstract. There is no quotation in texts.
- Need more specific results (one to several) and the conclusion

Reviewer Recommendation:

Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.

- 1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)
- 2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)
- 3. **Not Recommended**